

SUSAN L'ENGLE

*Picturing Gregory:
The Evolving Imagery
of Canon Law*

As an art historian specializing in the illustration of medieval manuscripts of canon and Roman law, my approach towards manuscripts has been primarily informed by the graphic and the pictorial, though not completely excluding the textual. Nevertheless, images do not reside in a vacuum, but are copied, adapted, created, and modified within particular social contexts, and for varying social reasons. Political, social, and religious issues may equally shape textual recensions or generate pictorial compositions that evolve over time.

The illustration and ornament in medieval legal texts can inform scholars in multiple disciplines. Certain iconographical themes predominate in specific time periods, only to lose their popularity and be replaced by new ones. The styles and decorative motifs utilized by individual artists can often serve to situate the time and region in which a manuscript was produced. Images not only document changes in theological, devotional, and political thought, but can also be used to help date particular manuscripts when the evidence offered by script and text is inconclusive. In addition, the changing visual commentary can signal how these texts and their interpretation were perceived by or resonated with a medieval audience.

This paper surveys images created for the opening of the *Liber extra* between around 1240 and 1350, from a variety of standpoints: iconography, page layout, patrons and readers - and also suggests possible ideological agendas that might be embedded in the illustrations. The manuscripts under consideration originate from Italy and northern Europe: Italian examples range in date from 1239

through the 1350s, but for the North, most manuscripts I have examined were produced in the late thirteenth century, with only four examples from the fourteenth. Please see the Appendix for the list of manuscripts, separated into northern and Italian and arranged in rough chronological order.

Not long after Gregory IX promulgated his decretal collection in 1234, illuminators created pictures to represent the themes of the five-division format established by Bernard of Pavia (d. 1213).¹ Most manuscripts of the *Liber extra* open with a short prologue, beginning with a large initial *G* for *Gregorius* that prefaces the address of promulgation, and followed by the text of the papal bull *Rex pacificus*. In some early illuminated copies of the *Liber extra* the *G* is historiated, either with a representation of Gregory making a blessing gesture,² a writing nimbed figure,³ or an enthroned Pope Gregory holding a crozier or cross staff.⁴ These iconic configurations function as symbols of

¹ Created between 1188 and 1192, the five divisions comprise 1) on ordination and ecclesiastical offices, opening under the title *De summa trinitate et fide catholica*; 2) on judicial organization and civil cases: *De iudicis*; 3) on issues affecting the clergy: *De vita et honestate clericorum*; 4) on marriage: *De sponsalibus et matrimoniis*; and 5) on criminal procedure: *De accusationibus*.

² Such as Troyes, BM MS 247 fol. 1r (Internet: see Indice III); and Admont, Stiftsbibl. MS 27 fol. 4r (Fig. 1, and also Internet: see Indice III).

³ Munich, BSB Clm. 17737 fol. 1r. (Fig. 89).

⁴ See Berkeley, Robbins Collection, MS 100 fol. 1r (Internet: see Indice III).

authorship and authority that approve and legitimize the text, and continue a long tradition of using officiating figures for this purpose. Before examining the illustrations created for the *Liber extra*, a brief review of comparable images from earlier, related texts, can give us a pictorial context in which to assess later developments.

Particularly relevant are depictions of the early ecumenical councils that survive in frescoes, mosaics, and manuscripts. Roger Reynolds especially has discussed early medieval illustrations of church councils as signs of the authenticity and authority of their conciliar decisions.⁵ Three important early canon law collections found in the ninth-century Vercelli, Biblioteca Capitolare, MS CLXV are preceded by illustrations of the first three ecumenical councils of Nicaea, Constantinople, and Ephesus.⁶ In these pictures contemporaneous emperors supervise and validate the proceedings, accompanied by groups of conciliar clerics; in most manuscripts the emperor is crowned, holds a symbolic object embodying the written law (a book or a scroll), and is attended by armed soldiers, representing the enforcement of civil rule. A mid-eleventh century *Collectio canonum* in the Vatican Library (Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica

⁵ REYNOLDS, Rites and Signs of Conciliar Decisions in the Early Middle Ages, in: *Segni e riti nella chiesa altomedievale occidentale*, Settimane di studio del Centro Italiano di studi sull'alto medioevo 33, 2 vols., Spoleto, 1987, vol. 1, p. 207-244 at p. 208.

⁶ Fol. 2v-5r, illustrated in REYNOLDS, Rites and Signs, figs. 4-7.

Vaticana, MS Vat. lat. 1339) is prefaced by a famous sequence of depictions of the first six councils, which place the emperor and his retinue at the top, groups of clerics at center, and images of fallen heretics below.⁷ As in the Vercelli codex, the emperor always occupies the primary position. These compositions epitomize council rituals such as debates in the presence of church and state officials, and the condemnation of heretics.⁸

The most colorful representations of councils are found in two richly illustrated tenth century manuscripts of the *Collectio canonum Hispana*, known as the *Codex Vigilanus* and the *Codex Emilianus*.⁹ Their texts include the acts of church councils and

⁷ See REYNOLDS, *Rites and Signs*, p. 215 and figs. 8–16; see also E. B. GARRISON, *Studies in the History of Medieval Italian Painting*, 4 vols., London, 1993, vol. 4, p. 235–41 and figs. 186–190: Additional Pre-Revival Umbro-Roman Manuscripts II, 1: *Collectio Canonum Farfensis* in the Vaticana.

⁸ REYNOLDS, *Rites and Signs*, p. 221.

⁹ *Codex Vigilanus* = El Escorial, Monasterio de San Lorenzo del Escorial Library, MS D.1.2; *Codex Emilianus* = El Escorial, Monasterio de San Lorenzo del Escorial Library, MS D.1.1. For a discussion of the textual tradition, see G. MARTÍNEZ DíEZ, *La collection canonica hispana*, 6 vols. (Madrid, 1966–2002), vol. 1: *Estudio*, and especially p. 103–172; on the images, see S. DE SILVA Y VERASTEGUI, *L'illustration des manuscrits de la Collection Canonique Hispana*, *Cahiers de civilisation médiévale* 32 (1989), p. 247–261 and for color reproductions see also EAD., *Iconografía del siglo X en el reino de Pamplona-Nájera*, Pamplona 1984 and *La Miniatura Medieval en Navarra*, Pamplona 1988.

papal decretals, and the illustrations have clearly expressed iconographical details. Bishops and emperors hold staffs and scepters as symbols of office and authority, and again, rolls or codices as symbols of the written law. The emperor Constantine presides in the representations of the Council of Elvira. Depictions of secular authority will appear in later canon law manuscripts at varying levels of importance, especially in the *Decretum Gratiani* and the *Liber extra*, but are of course essential in early manuscripts of civil law. In a ninth- to tenth-century miscellany of early customary laws (Modena, Biblioteca Capitolare, MS O.I.2), full-page images of paired secular rulers open the various texts: enthroned, they are depicted frontally or at three-quarters view and hold staffs and wear swords.¹⁰ In the following discussions it will become clear that twelfth- to fourteenth-century representations of authority and legitimacy were recycled from the past, and many iconographical features remain constant.

¹⁰ Modena, Bibl. Capit., MS O.I.2; on this manuscript see most recently: *Leges Salicae, Ripuariae, Longobardorum, Baioariorum, Caroli Magni*: Archivio del Capitolo della cattedrale di Modena O.1.2, Modena 2008, with a CD ROM and texts by P. GOLINELLI and G. Z. ZANICHELLI; on illustrations of early customary law in general see L. SPECIALE, *Immagini della regalità longobarda*, *Cahiers Archéologiques* 47 (1999), p. 39–53, and G. Z. ZANICHELLI, *Tra oralità e scrittura: le immagini del legislatore nei codici altomedievali*, in: A. C. QUINTAVALLE (ed.), *Medioevo: arte e storia*, Atti del Convegno internazionale di studi, Parma, 18-22 settembre 2007, Milano 2008, p. 165-177.

By the time that canon law became an academic discipline independent from theology, shortly after the appearance of Gratian's *Decretum*, this and the subsequent *Liber extra* became the fundamental texts in the formal study and teaching of canon law. While the compositions created for their openings derive many visual components from earlier imagery, they are deployed with a different focus, since they interpret the beginning passages of their texts. In the *Decretum Gratiani*, for example, in contrast with the *Liber extra*, its opening words do not celebrate an author but rather define the dual forces that rule humankind, that is, natural law and usages, the divine and the human. This concept was pictorialized in various ways. In the initial *H* (*Humanum genus*) a few twelfth-century compositions actually privilege a divine ruler in a superior position, presiding from the upper space of the *H* over the two temporal rulers in the lower (pope and emperor), or reigning as ruler of heaven and dictating the law to the writing figure of Gratian as a monk as he composes the *Decretum*.¹¹ The most common twelfth-century configuration shows pope and emperor side by side in a situation of parity, with the pope, however, always on the left, representing the favored right hand side of the invisible divinity. An alternative composition more clearly favors the ecclesiastical ruler, who occupies the upper space of the initial. By late thirteenth century and into the fourteenth the divine ruler

¹¹ The first is exemplified in Beaune, BM MS 5 fol. 4r and the second by Douai, BM MS 586 fol. 2r, both viewable on Internet (see Indice III).

assumes primary status in Italian manuscripts, and fourteenth-century miniatures feature the Division of Secular and Ecclesiastic Powers motif, in which the presiding, central figure of the deity presents directly (or indirectly from the hands of winged figures) objects of symbolic power to the hands of the ecclesiastic and secular rulers (either books to each, or a book to the pope and a sword to the emperor or king).¹² Some of these elements are also incorporated into Italian copies of the *Liber extra*. Among thirteenth- and fourteenth-century northern copies of the *Decretum*, however, compositions are divided between those that feature both temporal rulers, and those that depict the pope alone, who represents both laws.¹³

For the opening of the *Liber extra*, three pictorial topics are suggested in the address of promulgation by Pope Gregory IX, and in the following text of his papal bull: the name of the promulgator (*Gregorius episcopus*); the compiler of the *Liber extra*, (*frater Raymundus*), the Dominican Raymond of Peñafort; and the peaceful king (*Rex pacificus*). As mentioned above, some of the earliest illuminated copies of the *Liber extra* produced in Italy and in the North open modestly with single representations of Pope Gregory IX within the initial G. In others, however, the Prologue illustration honors not only Gregory as

¹² See illustrations in A. MELNIKAS, *The Corpus of the Miniatures in the Manuscripts of the Decretum Gratiani*, 3 vols., *Studia Gratiana XVI–XVIII*, Roma 1975, vol. 1, p. 79–86, figs. 34, 36, 37, 39, 40, 41, and 42, and color plates VIII and IX.

¹³ Examples of all compositions, Italian and northern, are found in MELNIKAS, vol. 1, p. 65–104.

sponsor but in addition Raymond as the actual executor of the literary work. In the earliest dated Italian manuscript (1239) the miniature depicts Gregory initiating the enterprise and Raymond in the act of writing;¹⁴ in another dated 1241 the enthroned Gregory receives the finished book from the kneeling Raymond, garbed in the Dominican habit.¹⁵ This iconographic theme - the presentation of a completed text to the patron by its author - was used as an opening motif in many manuscript genres, although it would be phased out of the *Liber extra* during the fourteenth century. A minimal composition pairing Gregory with Raymond prevails in northern manuscripts along the thirteenth century,¹⁶ except for a more populated miniature executed around 1300 by an illuminator with roots in Toulouse.¹⁷ Here Pope Gregory, attended by a large group of ecclesiastics and laymen, blesses with his right hand and receives a nicely bound codex

¹⁴ Firenze, Laurenziana, MS S. Croce III sin. 9 fol. 1r; illustrated by G. VALAGUSSA, in: M. MEDICA (ed.), *Duecento: Forme e colori del Medioevo a Bologna, Venezia 2000*, p. 166–168, cat. no. 38.

¹⁵ Oxford, Bodleian, MS lat. theol. b.4 fol. 1r, (Fig. 116 and also Internet: see Indice III).

¹⁶ Examples are Nürnberg, Stadtbibl., MS Cent. II.43 fol. 1r (Fig. 105); Reims, BM, MS 697 fol. 1r; Bourges, BM, MS 189 fol. 1r; and Philadelphia, Free Library, MS Lewis 158 (77) fol. 1r. For MSS Bourges and Reims see Internet (Indice III).

¹⁷ Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, MS McClean 136 fol. 1r, described and reproduced in S. L'ENGLE, R. GIBBS, *Illuminating the Law: Legal Manuscripts in Cambridge Collections*, London and Turnhout 2001, p. 196–204.

from Raymond, now depicted as a Franciscan. Another French exception is initially difficult to interpret in the context of the *Liber extra*: a quadripartite panel presents four stages of the Creation, ending with the extraction of Eve from Adam's side.¹⁸ However, this composition has migrated from earlier sources: a representation of Adam and Eve being tempted in the Garden of Eden appears in both tenth-century copies of the *Collectio canonum Hispana*,¹⁹ Marta and thereafter a number of northern European copies of the *Decretum Gratiani* incorporate one or more parts of the story of Adam and Eve, to exemplify divine law and its authority over humankind.²⁰

Thirteenth-century Italian miniatures present a few variations on the Gregory/Raymond paradigm. In a couple of manuscripts the enthroned Gregory occupies a central position on a semi-circular platform, flanked by members of his curia. Because of this layout, Raymond, holding his book, is obliged to enter from the left.²¹ Various artists

¹⁸ Toledo, Bibl. Capit., MS 4-8 fol. 1r (Fig. 129).

¹⁹ Illustrated in DE SILVA Y VERASTEGUI, *Iconografía del siglo X* (see n. 9), color plates 1, 2 (facing page 168).

²⁰ Barcelona, ACA, MS S. Cugat 1 (già 8) fol. 1r, Douai, BM MS 588 fol. 1r (Internet see *Indice III*) and Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, MS 262; see MELNIKAS (see n. 12), vol. 1, p. 91-92, figs. 49-51.

²¹ BAV, MS Pal. lat. 629 fol. 1v (Fig. 13; and also reproduced in color in W. BERSCHIN, *Die Palatina in der Vaticana: Eine deutsche Bibliothek in Rom*, Darmstadt 1992, p. 76 and 78, color plates 60 and 60A) and Vicenza, Bibl. Com., MS 11 fol. 2r; described and illustrated in N. GIOVÈ

working in the Byzantinizing style added to the foreground a cleric in proskynesis, kissing or embracing Gregory's feet.²² Unusual iconographical elements appear from time to time. A complex composition present in two manuscripts illustrated by the same Italian workshop depicts the enthroned Pope Gregory energetically promulgating his book, which takes the form of a long, unwound roll launched diagonally across the page.²³ The extended roll serves as a vehicle and sign of speech, transmitting the written word directly from the pope's hand to the doctors and scholars of Bologna, who stretch out their hands to receive it.

The last pictorial topic treated on the Prologue page is associated with the initial R that introduces the papal bull *Rex pacificus*. This initial is usually executed in ink or paint and decorated with vegetal or geometric motifs. Occasionally it is historiated, and in this case there seems not to have been consensus as to the identity of the "peaceful king." Among both northern and Italian works, the "king" is interpreted variously as Christ or God the

MARCHIOLI et al. (ed.), *I manoscritti medievali di Vicenza e provincia*, Venezia 2007, p. 24–25 and tav. 11.

²² Such as Padua, Bibl. Capit., MS A.28 fol. 1v; BAV, MS Pal. lat. 632 fol. 1r (color illustration in BERSCHIN, *Die Palatina*, p. 79, color plate 61) and Laon, BM MS 357 fol. 1v.

²³ Lucca, Bibl. Capit., MS 137 fol. 4r and Piacenza, Bibl. Capit., MS 59 fol. 1r; both illustrated by M. BOLLATI, in: MEDICA, *Duecento* (see n. 14), p. 257–261, cat. nos. 75 and 76.

Father;²⁴ a crowned monarch;²⁵ the Virgin Mary with Child;²⁶ and Pope Gregory himself.²⁷ These variations might express the personal views of a patron or an illuminator or the socio-political viewpoints of a region or time period.

One more theme doubtless reflects the important role of the *Liber extra* in the university curriculum, and this is the portrayal of scenes of teaching and study. As far as I can determine, this initiates in northern late thirteenth-century manuscripts such as San Marino, Huntington Library, MS 19999 fol. 1r, where we find a tonsured professor seated before a bookstand, lecturing to a group of seated students, neatly inserted into the initial *G*; or the miniature in Cambrai, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 619 fol. 1r, which depicts a master clothed as a secular lawyer, also lecturing to students.²⁸ This subject matter was

²⁴ In Frankfurt, Stadt- und Univ.bibl., MS Barth. 11 fol. 5r (described in G. POWITZ, H. BUCK (ed.), *Die Handschriften des Bartholomaeusstifts und des Karmeliterklosters in Frankfurt am Main*, Frankfurt am Main 1974, p. 26–27) and Munich, BSB Clm 14011 fol. 2v (Fig. 83).

²⁵ Toledo, Bibl. Capit., MS 4-7 fol. 2r and San Marino, Huntington Library, MS HM 19999 fol. 1r.

²⁶ Angers, BM MS 378 fol. 1v (Internet: see Indice III) and New York, Morgan Library and Museum, MS M.716 fol. 1v (Internet: see Indice III), illustrated in A. CONTI, *La miniatura bolognese: scuole e botteghe, 1270–1340*, Bologna 1981, fig. 236.

²⁷ Cambrai, BM, MS 619 fol. 1r and Graz, Univ.bibl., MS 40 fol. 1v.

²⁸ For the Huntington and Cambrai images see Internet (Indice III).

especially popular in fourteenth-century Bologna, where it was executed in monumental format on the tombs of famous Bolognese jurists and canonists, and used for the opening miniatures to civil and canon law texts, underscoring the importance of the author and the utility of his work. In two large *Liber extra* miniatures of similar design from the 1320s the pope and his enclave occupy the lefthand half of the picture plane, while on the right a figure lectures from a raised architectural throne to a group of students seated below around a continuous study table that angles around the base of the throne.²⁹

In Italy there is a constant evolution of layout and opening compositions for the *Liber extra* from the late thirteenth century onwards, and we must ask who was responsible for these innovations, and why they were implemented. In terms of layout, the two earliest dated Italian manuscripts discussed above opened with the Prologue miniature on the first folio recto, having only penwork initials for the opening of Book One; slightly later, an illustration was created for Book One, but it was either placed on the verso of the Prologue leaf or on the next

²⁹ Toledo, Bibl. Capit., MS 4-7 fol. 2r and Oxford, Bodleian, MS Add. A. 188, this latter a fragmented leaf existing as opening and ending flyleaves to its host manuscript, described and illustrated in O. PÄCHT, J. J. G. ALEXANDER, *Illuminated Manuscripts in the Bodleian Library Oxford II: Italian School*, Oxford 1970, p. 13, cat. no. 122 and pl. XII.

recto page.³⁰ Abruptly an elaborate and more dramatic opening was devised, repositioning the Prologue page to the verso side of the opening folio. This probably initiated around 1300 with the extraordinary Vatican City, BAV MS Pal. lat. 629, although it is difficult to date manuscripts of this period precisely. Its Byzantinizing illumination was executed by an artist we call Jacopino da Reggio who has also been credited with the overall planning and design.³¹ In the new arrangement the manuscript would begin with a blank recto, and a turn of the page revealed a symmetrical double-page arrangement for text and gloss of the Prologue and Book One, having the text on each page preceded by a one-column miniature and a historiated initial.³² Now the reader is compelled to consider the Prologue and Book One as a single entity, visually and conceptually, pairing the representation of authority and legitimization with the expression of

³⁰ Some examples are Frankfurt, Stadt- und Univ.bibl., MS Barth. 11 fols. 5r, 6r and Lucca, Bibl. Capit. MS 137 fols. 4r, 4v.

³¹ On this illuminator see first CONTI, *La miniatura bolognese* (see n. 26), p. 9, 14 and note, p. 16, 25, 35 note, p. 42, 43 and note, p. 44–48 and note, p. 49, 50, 51 and note, p. 52, 53, 54, 55, 59, 63, 69.

³² Illustrated in P. BURKHART, *Die Dekretalenhandschrift Vat. Pal. Lat. 629 und die bologneser Buchmalerei am Ende des XIII. Jahrhunderts*, in: W. BERSCHIN (ed.), *Palatina-Studien, Miscellanea Bibliothecae Apostolicae Vaticanae V, Studi e Testi 365*, Città del Vaticano 1997, p. 33–51 and figs. 2–3 on Taf. II–III; fol. 1v reproduced also in color in BERSCHIN, *Die Palatina* (see n. 21).

the doctrine of Catholic faith. With few exceptions, this format was maintained for the most elaborately illuminated manuscripts produced in Bologna and Padua through mid fourteenth century, and for this reason the two opening images will henceforth be considered together.³³

Although in previous years I had assigned the concept and planning of the new layout entirely to the illuminator of Pal. lat. 629 (Fig. 13-18), today I hesitate to attribute extreme changes to the craftsman alone. There were indeed many talented and proficient illuminators working in northern Italy and we have some splendid manuscripts as witness. But when a variation in layout or iconography occurs unexpectedly during a time period or within a distinct geographical region, as Jonathan Alexander reminds us, "in each case specific historical explanations are needed to explain how and why ... alterations or new departures could have been made."³⁴ It is necessary to consider the social and political concerns of the period, and in this context, suppose that a manuscript's patron had a concept that he wished to be represented pictorially and forcefully, and that he discussed with the illuminator how this could best be expressed.

³³ These include BAV, MSS Pal. lat. 631, Urb. lat. 159, Vat. lat. 1386, Vat. lat. 1389 and Graz, UB, MS 40; Lucca, Bibl. Capit., MS 287; New York, Morgan Library and Museum, MS M.716 fol. 1v, 2r (illustrated by the Master of 1328 and reproduced in CONTI [see n. 26], figs. 236, 237); Padua, Bibl. Capit., MS A.1 and Toledo, Bibl. Capit., MS 4-6.

³⁴ J. J. G. ALEXANDER, *Medieval Illuminators and their Methods of Work*, New Haven 1992, p. 52.

In fourteenth-century *Liber extra* manuscripts illuminated in Bologna and Padua there are not only radical changes in layout but also transformations in composition and iconography. There is first the entry of a variety of sacred figures and theological concepts into the composition for Book One: the central figure alternates between the cross-haloed deity and a Trinity; and is accompanied by angels and prophets,³⁵ signs of the Evangelists,³⁶ the Virgin and St. Peter³⁷ and the Virgin and John the Baptist,³⁸ Peter and Paul;³⁹ and a large audience of haloed figures.⁴⁰ In a few cases the Division of Powers motif is borrowed from the *Decretum Gratiani* and incorporated into Prologue and Book I miniatures.⁴¹ In the contemporaneous BAV MS Vat. lat. 1385,

³⁵ BAV, MS Pal. lat. 632 fol. 1v; Chantilly, Musée Condé, MS 216 fol. 1v; Graz, UB, MS 40 fol. 3r; Padua, Bibl. Capit., MS A.28 fol. 2r.

³⁶ Frankfurt, Stadt- und Univ.bibl. MS Barth. 11 fol. 6r; Siena, Bibl. Com., MS H.III.14 fol. 1r.

³⁷ Frankfurt, Stadt- und Univ.bibl., MS Bart. 11 fol. 6r.

³⁸ BAV, MS Vat. lat. 1390 fol. 2v; New York, Morgan Library & Museum, MS M.716 fol. 2r.

³⁹ BAV, MS Vat. lat. 1387 fol. 2r; Baltimore, Walters Art Museum, MS W.158 fol. 1v.

⁴⁰ Angers, BM MS 378 fol. 2r (Internet: see Indice III); BAV, MS Vat. lat. 1389 fol. 4r. (Fig. 26); New York, Morgan Library & Museum, MS M.716 fol. 2r.

⁴¹ BAV, MSS Pal. lat 631 fol. 2r and Vat. lat. 1385 fol. 1v; Morgan M.716 fol. 2r; Munich, BSB, Clm. 23560 fol. 2r (Fig. 91), this last, illuminated by the B 18 Master, duplicates the composition he executed for the opening miniature of a *Decretum Gratiani*: Madrid, BN, MS Res. 198 fol. 3r.

clerics kneel behind the pope who receives a mitre from an angel, and a corresponding group of lay figures kneel behind the king being crowned. These are not random iconographic increments, but images responding to a particular vision.

The miniature created for Book One in Morgan M.716 fol. 2r reveals such a comprehensive visual interpretation of the words of Innocent III in Title 1 that its details must surely have been specified by an individual for whom they resonated deeply. Here are described the articles of Catholic Faith, featuring belief in the Trinity, the immaculate conception of the son of God in the Virgin Mary, and Christ's human birth. This two-column miniature, complemented by marginal vignettes, provides an elaborate allegorical illustration.⁴² At upper center the enthroned Trinity is flanked by the Virgin on the left, and John the Baptist on the right, attended by kneeling angels. Two groups of six figures, most likely the twelve Apostles, are seated lower down on either side of the throne. In the foreground, two angels enact the Division of Secular and Ecclesiastic Powers by consigning a sword to a king and a book to a pope. In the marginal spaces below a warrior saint stands at center, exemplifying the militant defense of the faith; at his left and right the Angel Gabriel and the Virgin portray the Annunciation, representing the conception of the Son of God to save humankind. Just above the rubric, two monks in prayer evoke the contemplative life.

⁴² Besides the black-and-white reproductions cited in n. 33 above, see Internet (Indice III).

Another case of patron input is the unusual layout of two manuscripts, both inscribed with *pecia* indications that give evidence of controlled university production.⁴³ Instead of having the text surrounded by its gloss, Toledo 4-7, datable to the 1320s, has text and gloss written in two parallel columns, side by side. Vat. lat. 1388 was designed in five columns to hold text, gloss, and excerpts from Johannes Andreae's *Novella*. Supposedly prepared for the jurist Brunetto Andrea of Florence, its apparatus was signed in a colophon by Laurentius Petri of Florence and dated 1342.⁴⁴ In both manuscripts the large and impressive miniatures are also exceptional for the period in that they were not planned to face the composition for Book One; the manuscripts' many codicological anomalies point toward personalized commissions.

In the majority of cases, fourteenth-century Italian Prologue miniatures fall on the verso, opposing the Book One illustration on the next recto. Questions of layout aside, I see progressive changes in the physical presentation of Pope Gregory within an architectural environment, changes that cannot all be due to the influence of

⁴³ BAV, MS Vat. lat. 1388 and Toledo, Bibl. Capit., MS 4-7.

⁴⁴ Described in S. KUTTNER, R. ELZE, *A Catalogue of Canon and Roman Law Manuscripts in the Vatican library*, 2 vols., Studi e Testi 322, 328, Città del Vaticano 1986, 1987, vol. 1, p. 174-75; Giovanna MURANO notes that script and decoration are comparable with production standards at the University of Bologna, see EAD., *Copisti a Bologna (1265-1270)*, *Textes et études du Moyen âge* 37, Turnhout 2006, p. 73-74.

Giotto's monumental works in fresco. The simple, single level composition in which the pope is surrounded or flanked by members of the *consistorium* (e.g. Vat. lat. 1387, Padua A. 28, Pal. lat. 629 and 632, Chantilly 216, Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, MS 2066, and Nuremberg, Stadtbibliothek, MS Cent. II.45) dissolves, and throughout the late 1320s and early 30s the pope is gradually separated from the other *consistorium* members and placed upon an ever higher isolating throne that encloses and frames him within an escalating architectural structure (exemplified in Toledo 4-6, Walters Art Museum W.158, Morgan M.716, and Pal. lat. 631). At the same time, secular figures begin to enter the composition. Then in the 1340s, the arrangement metamorphoses once more into a closer-knit *consistorium*-like arrangement; cardinals and bishops are more closely associated with the pope; and lay figures interact in the foreground (such as Morgan M.716 fol. 2r; Angers 378 fol. 2r; BAV Vat. lat. 1389 fol. 2r, and Padua A 1).

I suspect these progressive changes are deliberate, and I suggest that the evolution of *Liber extra* iconography may also reflect contemporary ideas about the sources of Christian truth, the nature and limits of ecclesiastical authority, and questions about the sovereignty and infallibility of the pope. The transfer of the compositions for Prologue and Book One to a single visual identity at the manuscript opening implies that their iconography is co-dependent. The power and authority of the pope on the left is balanced by, and

perhaps subject to, the authority of the divine ruler and his holy associates, according to the articles of Catholic Faith expressed by Innocent III. Can we read this in two ways? Is this juxtaposition meant to imply that the pope's authority is supported by divine powers, or rather, that his authority is secondary to them? Does the appearance of biblical figures into the composition for Book One illustrate developments in theological thought and attitudes towards the Scriptures taking place at this time? Was the incorporation of the Division of Powers motif from the *Decretum Gratiani* for the Prologue composition meant to emphasize that authority was granted equally to both temporal rulers, negating the pope's sovereignty? Does the closer association of the pope with a larger group of members of the *consistorium*, side by side with an immense council of heaven, reveal a current belief that general councils in the church should have more authority, in order to limit the pope's centralized power? Questions of this sort were being discussed among philosophers, theologians, and canonists from the late thirteenth century and all along the fourteenth.⁴⁵ Another

⁴⁵ Some of the references I have consulted are B. TIERNEY, *Foundations of the Conciliar Theory: The Contribution of the Medieval Canonists from Gratian to the Great Schism*, Leiden 1998; B. SCHIMMELPFENNIG, *The Papacy*, New York 1992; A. J. DUGGAN, *Conciliar Law 1123–1215: The Legislation of the Four Lateran Councils*, in: W. HARTMANN, K. PENNINGTON (ed.), *The History of Medieval Canon Law in the Classical Period, 1140–1234: From Gratian to the Decretals of Pope Gregory IX*, Washington, D.C. 2008, p. 318–366; J. LECLERCQ, *Questions des XIIIe et XIVe siècles sur la juridiction de*

factor that surely influenced the tone of Italian compositions is the move of the papacy to Avignon in 1303, and the rule of seven successive French popes. Does this circumstance somehow relate to the fact that so few fourteenth-century northern illuminated copies of the *Liber extra* survive?

From another perspective, a great number of the Italian manuscripts I have examined were produced under university auspices by the *pecia* system, doubtless for the use of students, masters, and canon lawyers. While there certainly were wealthy students, I am inclined to believe that most of the richly illuminated manuscripts I have mentioned were commissioned by established professionals, probably with well-paying jobs, and perhaps working for church courts. The evolving iconography would be informed by contemporaneous political and juridical issues about which the manuscript patrons had definite opinions. Among these expensive commissions some (like Pal. lat. 629) show little sign of reader annotation and could have been prepared as gifts, perhaps to win favor from a person whose views were pictorially expressed on its pages. I must admit that there are many questions for which I have no concrete answers, and a great deal more research will be needed to reach any more

l'Église et le pouvoir séculier, in: *Studia Gratiana* 12 (1967), p. 311–324; and J. C. MAIRE VIGUEUR, *Religione e politica nella propaganda pontificia (Italia comunale, prima metà del XIII secolo)*, in: P. CAMMAROSANO (ed.), *Le forme della propaganda politica nel Due e nel Trecento*, Roma 1994, p. 65–83.

SUSAN L'ENGLE

definite conclusions. I hope this paper will provide readers with food for thought and conjecture.